

COMPARATIVE STUDIES OF MATRIMONIAL REMEDIES UNDER HINDU AND MUSLIM LAWS

AUTHOR – SHIPRA SINGH* & DR JUHI SAXENA**

* STUDENT AT AMITY UNIVERSITY LUCKNOW

** ASSISTANT PROFESSORS AT AMITY UNIVERSITY LUCKNOW

BEST CITATION – SHIPRA SINGH & DR JUHI SAXENA, COMPARATIVE STUDIES OF MATRIMONIAL REMEDIES UNDER HINDU AND MUSLIM LAWS, *INDIAN JOURNAL OF LEGAL REVIEW (IJLR)*, 6 (2) OF 2026, PG. 717-722, APIS – 3920 – 0001 & ISSN – 2583-2344.

Abstract

The remedies of matrimony constitute an important aspect of the Indian personal laws, providing the legal basis to deal with marriage disputes and safeguard the rights of individuals and bring about social justice in the marriage institution. These remedies exist under the special personal laws, especially the Hindu and Muslim laws, since India has a pluralistic legal system and are disparate in their conceptual basis, process, and relief. This paper engages in a comparative analysis of matrimonial remedies in Hindu law, which is mainly regulated by Hindu marriage act 1955 and Muslim law, which was regulated by Quran, Dissolution of Muslim marriages act 1939 and the judicial precedent. The paper looks at the most influential matrimonial remedies including restitution of conjugal rights, judicial separation, nullity of marriage, divorce and maintenance with the similarities and differences in their application. It fundamentally examines the character of marriage in both systems of law sacramental and contractual marriage, and the effect of this difference on the grounds of remedy and its flexibility. The special attention is given to the role of women, gender justice, and constitutionality of some practices. The paper also examines how the judiciary may act to balance the personal laws with the constitutional values of equality, dignity and personal liberty. Modern issues like the problem of gender inequality, the conflict between individual legislation and the basic rights and the current controversy on the Uniform Civil Code are discussed. The paper will come to the conclusion by highlighting the necessity of reform-based, gender, and constitutionally consistent matrimonial solutions and maintaining the plurality of the Indian personal law system. The article, based on doctrinal and comparative method, contributes to a better understanding of the matrimonial justice in India and the way the personal law reforms are going to have a new direction.

Keywords: Matrimonial Remedies; Hindu Marriage Act, 1955; Muslim Personal Law; Divorce; Maintenance; Gender Justice; Personal Laws; Constitutional Values; Comparative Study

1. Introduction

Matrimonial remedies are the legal exceptions that spouses can avail when their marital duties have been violated or when the marriage relationship fails¹. These solutions are crucial in controlling the family relations, protecting the right of individuals, and social justice in the marriage institution. Personal laws in India

regulate matrimonial remedies which implies a pluralistic legal system of the country and its tolerance to various religious customs. The Hindu and the Muslim laws of marriage are both considered as the civil and the religious institution, only that the nature and the focus of the marriage are very different. In the traditional Hindu law marriage was considered to be a

sacrament and the marriage is irremovable in nature; but statutory amendments like Hindu marriage act, 1955 have changed the aspect of marriage into a contract which can be dealt by the courts through remedies like divorce and judicial separation. By contrast, Muslim law views marriage (nikah) as more of a civil contract with a religious meaning, allowing many possible forms of dissolution and offering relatively free matrimonial solutions. The explanations of the comparative analysis of matrimonial remedies in the Hindu and Muslim laws are based on exploring the manner in which these two different legal jurisdictions deal with matrimonial breakdown, gender justice and constitutional values. This type of study allows finding out commonalities, dissimilarities, and the areas of the necessary reforms. This paper is limited to comparative analysis of essential remedies relating to matrimonial provisions of Hindu and Muslim laws in India. It uses a set-belief and comparative research design, which is based on statutory, judicial rulings and academic literature to critically examine the topic.

2. Concept of Matrimonial Remedies

Matrimonial reliefs refer to legal reliefs that spouses receive in a bid to resolve breaches of marital duties or an irreversible dissolution of marriage². Such remedies are to safeguard rights and interests of parties in a marriage, to be fair, dignified and socially stable. Matrimonial remedies never simply support the cessation of marriage but aim at saving the marital relationship where feasible striking between personal liberty and societal concerns. The remedies of matrimonial may be categorized into remedial, preventive and dissolutive remedies. Some of the remedial remedies are restitution of “conjugal rights and maintenance which attempts to recover marital harmony or as a supportive measure. Preventive solutions like judicial separation enable the spouses to lead a separate life without ending up the marriage³. Dissolutive remedies are divorce and nullity of marriage which formally dissolve or void the marital relationship as long as

continuation is no longer tenable. The courts are very instrumental in providing matrimonial relief by interpreting the statutory provisions, reviewing, and seeing to it that reliefs are awarded, according to the principle of equity, justice, and good conscience. Courts have the ability to strike a balance between legal standards and social realities using judicial discretion, especially when gender justice and constitutional rights are at stake. Matrimonial remedies in India have undergone a gradual change of religious inflexibility into statutory change and judicial involvement. Certain legislative acts and judicial interpretations have broadened the matrimonial remedies ensuring that personal laws are in line to contemporary ideas of equality, dignity as well as human rights.

3. Matrimonial Remedies under Hindu Law

The Hindu Marriage Act, 1955 (HMA) codified and reformed Hindu matrimonial law by introducing statutory remedies for marital disputes. These remedies reflect a shift from the traditional sacramental view of marriage towards a rights-based legal framework.

3.1 Restitution of Conjugal Rights

Section 9 of the HMA offers restitution of conjugal rights which allows an aggrieved spouse to seek a decree which orders the other spouse into reentering cohabitation when he or she withdraws out of the society without any satisfactory reason⁴. The necessity of the valid marriage and unreasonable withdrawal are the necessary requirements. The defenses that can be offered are cruelty, desertion, or any other excuse that has a legal reason. This solution has been constitutional tested especially on matters of individual liberty and privacy where the courts have given mixed opinions on its legitimacy.

3.2 Judicial Separation

Separate living without divorce is permitted under Section 10, which is judicial separation. The reasons of separation of judiciary are the same ones as those of divorce in Section 13. The

order freezes the rights and responsibilities of marital relationship especially cohabiting but spares the bond of marital relationship. It is a corrective action meant to give space to reconciliation or ease future divorce in the event of failure in reconciliation.

3.3 Nullity of Marriage

Nullity of marriage deals with invalid marriages⁵. In section 11, some marriages are declared void ab initio, including the marriages that violate the terms of monogamy or those that are forbidden. Section 12 concerns the voidable marriages, which are considered to be valid until they are voided by a court due to impotence, fraud or absence of a valid consent. Legal implications involve establishing status and protection against legitimacy of children.

3.4 Divorce under Hindu Law

In section 13, various reasons are given to divorce such as cruelty, desertion, adultery, conversion, mental disorder, and incurable disease⁶. The wives are given special grounds in section 13(2) based on the historical gender disadvantage. Section 13B brought in the concept of divorce by mutual consent and this gave more prominence towards autonomy and minimized litigation that was hostile.

3.5 Maintenance and Alimony

The 24 and 25 sections enable the courts to award interim and permanent alimony to maintain financial security of the spouses who are dependent. In addition, the provision of a secular resolution to maintenance in Section 125 of the Criminal Procedure Code supports the tenets of social justice on extending the principles of personal law.

4. Matrimonial Remedies under Muslim Law

Muslim matrimonial law in India is derived from Quranic principles, classical Islamic jurisprudence, statutory enactments, and judicial interpretations. Marriage (nikah) under Muslim law is regarded as a civil contract with religious significance, which directly influences the nature and flexibility of matrimonial

remedies available to spouses.

4.1 Restitution of Conjugal Rights

According to the Muslim law, marriage presents a way through which a spouse may request the other to resume cohabiting with him or her in case of withdrawal without any legal reasons⁷. This remedy is based on contractual principles as opposed to statutory provisions, unlike the Hindu law. Cruelty, non-payment of dower (mehr), non-payment of maintenance, or any act that causes cohabitation to be unsafe or unjust are all some of the defenses that the wife has. This remedy has generally been supported by Indian courts but they have made sure that it is not applied in a way that invades dignity or personal freedom.

4.2 Divorce under Muslim Law

The Muslim law acknowledges that there are various types of divorce as it is a contractual marriage. Talaq-e-Ahsan and Talaq-e-Hasan are divorce forms by the husband and deemed to have to be approved by reasonableness and scope to be reconciled⁸. Lastly, the Supreme Court made instant triple talaq procedure (talaq-e-biddat) unconstitutional in a case titled Shayara Bano v. Union of India. Wife divorce involves Talaq-e-Tafweez where the husband delegates power of divorce, and Lian, which is founded on false charges of adultery. The laws that regulate judicial divorce include Dissolution of Muslim Marriages Act, 1939 that gives particular reasons, including cruelty, desertion, and failure to maintain. Mutual consent divorce is legalized in the form of Khula and Mubarat by focusing on consensual divorce.

4.3 Muslim law of maintenance.

In Muslim traditional law, the right of the divorced woman to maintenance is restricted to the iddat period, which is a personal approach in the law, which prioritizes the conclusiveness of the marital duties once divorce has occurred. The Muslim Women (Protection of Rights on Divorce) Act, 1986, which stipulates that there should be a reasonable and fair provision and

maintenance to be made during iddat period, rights to mehr and restitution of properties also gave statutory force to this position. There was however an issue raised that this framework was not going to be sufficient in ensuring that divorced Muslim women were not subjected to economic hardships and destitution. In order to fill this lapse, the secular solution as per Section 125, Criminal Procedure Code is more important. Section 125 is based on social justice and is applicable regardless of religion whereby a divorced woman who cannot sustain herself is entitled to receive maintenance by the former husband. The provisions have been reconciled by judicial interpretations with an emphasis that Section 125 is a prophylaxis to avoid vagrancy and so as to uphold the constitutional values of equality and dignity of women.

5. Comparative Analysis of Matrimonial Remedies

Marriage, as per Hindu and Muslim laws, is of great significance when it comes to the matrimonial remedies that the spouses are entitled to⁹. Marriage is a sacrament by Hindu law, but there is statutory reform relating to the introduction of an element of contractual and civil marriage. Muslim law, in turn, considers marriage to be a religious civil contract but more flexible in its termination. It is this theoretical difference that justifies the relatively ordered and codified remedies under the Hindu law and pluralistic, contractual remedies under the Muslim law. There are common reasons to divorce in both legal systems, including cruelty, desertion and failure to maintain, which represent converging interests in marital justice. Nonetheless, Hindu law gives a complete statutory list of reasons, whereas the Muslim law offers both statutory and non-statutory dissolution¹⁰. The most significant of the differences between the two systems is the unilateral divorce that Muslim husbands could get, albeit currently being constitutionally limited. The role of women in matrimonial remedies has been changing with the legislative amendments and judicial interpretation. Hindu law has gradually transformed the rights of

women by providing special reasons to divorce and provision of maintenance. The Muslim law and especially through the Dissolution of Muslim Marriages Act, 1939 and judicial interpretation has improved access to judicial divorce and judicial maintenance by women although it is still a challenge. Reviewing by the courts is important to align individual laws to the constitution. Courts are mandated with discretion to provide fairness, to avoid remedy abuse, and to safeguard the fundamental rights. Constitutional validity, in particular, gender equality and the right to personal liberty have led to reinterpretation or overturning of discriminatory practices by the courts. Judicially, the Hindu law requires an official court to administer most of the remedies, whereas the Muslim law acknowledges extra-judicial means of divorce, which causes a high procedural variance.

6. Role of Judiciary in Harmonizing Personal Laws

The Indian judiciary has transformed by harmonizing personal laws with the constitutional values. Courts have made historic rulings that have reinterpreted the matrimonial remedies by putting the personal laws to test as per the fundamental rights¹¹. The progressive interpretative approach has been embraced by the courts to eradicate gender discrimination but not to interfere with religious freedom. The court rulings state that individual laws can not be left unquestioned by the constitutional morality. Putting equality, dignity, and social justice as a priority the judiciary has been able to integrate matrimonial remedies across personal laws without the provision of uniformity hence creating a balanced co-existence between the tradition and the constitutional rule.

7. Contemporary Issues and Challenges

Matrimonial remedies under personal laws still experience great challenges despite the legislative reforms and the interventions by the judiciary. The issue of gender inequality has always been one of the primary ones, especially

regarding the inequality of access to divorce and maintenance remedies. Although Hindu law has slowly adopted gender parity, some of the practices of the Muslim law have been historically biased towards women and may need judicial redress. In even set laws, procedural delays and burden of proving often overboard women. The controversy of the Uniform Civil Code (UCC) also brings out the conflict between the liberty of personal law and the necessity to have the same matrimonial justice. Critics claim that personal law is perpetuating imbalance whereas those who believe in pluralism warn against the weakening of religious liberty. This discussion is especially tricky when the law of the individual clashes with basic rights equality, dignity and personal freedoms. This conflict often places courts in a position of having to negotiate the enforced constitutional requirements and the observed religious practice. The other urgent issue is that the laws of matrimony are divided and as a result, there exist discrepancies in the remedies, process, and execution. Such inequalities point towards the necessity of a radical change that would bring personal laws in line with the reality of life in the modern society and the principles of the Constitution.

8. Suggestions and Recommendations

To cope with these problems, matrimonial remedies should be changed so that they would provide gender-neutral and fair results in personal laws. Remedies can be applied arbitrarily, which can be prevented by the presence of legislative clarity and the provision of a consistent procedural protection. The judicial control has to be enhanced to reduce the abuse of unilateral or extra-judicial remedies. Moreover, compatible procedural norms should also promote fairness and predictability, although to the extent that will not flatten substantive religious values and norms. Legal consciousness and available dispute resolution systems are also an important aspect in helping people to exercise their matrimonial rights.

9. Conclusion

This paper has discussed matrimonial redresses in Hindu and Muslim laws in a comparative framework and this paper has explored both similarity and difference in terms of legal principles and practice. The comparative strategy emphasizes the role of judicial intervention by the significance of constitutional values in crafting fair matrimonial remedies. Reform going forward should aim at harmonization and gender justice as well as accessibility so that matrimonial laws can be sensitive to changing social requirements in India.

Reference

1. Rao V. A Comparative Study of Hindu and Muslim Marriages and Divorces. Issue 2 Indian JL & Legal Rsch.. 2023;5:1.
2. Noor T. *Comparative Analysis On Hindu Personal Law between Bangladesh and India* (Doctoral dissertation, East West University).
3. Vashishtha S. Comparative analysis between the Hindu and Muslim maintenance laws. Issue 1 Indian JL & Legal Rsch.. 2022;4:1.
4. Sindhuja D, Choudhary S. Comparison of Marriage under Hindu Law and Muslim Law. Issue 1 Int'l JL Mgmt. & Human.. 2021;4:2076.
5. Choudhary G, Basak B. Marriages under Different Laws". Issue 4 Int'l JL Mgmt. & Human.. 2020;3:2431.
6. Kapoor S. Beyond Courtrooms: A Comparative Study of Mediation and Litigation in Matrimonial Dispute Resolution. International Journal of Dispute Resolution. 2025 Aug 30;1(4):1-74.
7. Subramanian N. Islamic Norms, Common Law, and Legal Reasoning: Muslim Personal Law and the Economic Consequences of Divorce in India. Islamic Law and Society. 2017 Jun 9;24(3):254-86.

8. Ahmed I. *Adequacy of Matrimonial Reliefs Under the Personal Laws in India: A Human Rights Perspective* (Doctoral dissertation).
9. Mohanty A. Muslim Women, Marital Dissolution and Uniform Civil Code in India. *Journal of Law and Legal Research Development*. 2025 Oct 18:01-12.
10. Ghosh S, Chakrabarti A. Religion-based 'Personal' Law, Legal Pluralism and Secularity: A Field View of Adjudication under Muslim Personal Law in India. *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion*. 2021 Jun 1;10(2):254-74.
11. Krishna D. Research Paper Role Of Family Courts In Hindu Marriages Table Of Contents. Available at SSRN 5338002. 2025 Jun 18.
- 8 Ahmed I. *Adequacy of Matrimonial Reliefs Under the Personal Laws in India: A Human Rights Perspective* (Doctoral dissertation).
- 9 Mohanty A. Muslim Women, Marital Dissolution and Uniform Civil Code in India. *Journal of Law and Legal Research Development*. 2025 Oct 18:01-12.
- 10 Ghosh S, Chakrabarti A. Religion-based 'Personal' Law, Legal Pluralism and Secularity: A Field View of Adjudication under Muslim Personal Law in India. *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion*. 2021 Jun 1;10(2):254-74.
- 11 Krishna D. Research Paper Role Of Family Courts In Hindu Marriages Table Of Contents". Available at SSRN 5338002. 2025 Jun 18.

ENDNOTES

- 1 Rao V. A Comparative Study of Hindu and Muslim Marriages and Divorces. *Issue 2 Indian JL & Legal Rsch.* 2023;5:1.
- 2 Noor T. "Comparative Analysis On Hindu Personal Law between Bangladesh and India (Doctoral dissertation, East West University).
- 3 Vashishtha S. Comparative analysis between the Hindu and Muslim maintenance laws. *Issue 1 Indian JL & Legal Rsch.* 2022;4:1.
- 4 Sindhuja D, Choudhary S. Comparison of Marriage under Hindu Law and Muslim Law. *Issue 1 Int'l JL Mgmt. & Human.* 2021;4:2076.
- 5 Choudhary G, Basak B. Marriages under Different Laws. *Issue 4 Int'l JL Mgmt. & Human.* 2020;3:2431.
- 6 Kapoor S. Beyond Courtrooms: A Comparative Study of Mediation and Litigation in Matrimonial Dispute Resolution. *International Journal of Dispute Resolution*. 2025 Aug 30;1(4):1-74.
- 7 Subramanian N. Islamic Norms, Common Law, and Legal Reasoning: Muslim Personal Law and the Economic Consequences of Divorce in India. *Islamic Law and Society*. 2017 Jun 9;24(3):254-86.